UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

)	
JOHN D. CERQUEIRA,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	
)	CIVIL ACTION NO.: 05-11652 WGY
AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC.,)	
)	
Defendant.)	
)	

DEFENDANT AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC.'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S
FOURTH MOTION IN LIMINE SEEKING TO PRECLUDE AMERICAN AIRLINES,
INC. FROM INTRODUCING INTO EVIDENCE INFORMATION REGARDING THE
SECURITY CONCERNS IN EXISTENCE AT THE TIME AMERICAN AIRLINES,
INC.'S SYSTEM OPERATIONS CONTROL MANAGER DECIDED TO DENY
REBOOKING TO MR. CERQUEIRA

On December 28, 2003, American Airlines, Inc. ("American") removed Mr. Cerqueira and two other passengers from Flight 2237 for questioning due to their unusual behavior. The three passengers were questioned by Massachusetts State Police and eventually were told that they were free to go. However, the manager on duty of System Operations Control (SOC) at American, Craig Marquis, decided not to allow them to rebook travel on American on that date because of security concerns. That decision is documented in the Passenger Name Record attached as Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's motion.

Because Mr. Marquis and his subordinate, Rhonda Cobbs, have no independent recollection at this time of the security concerns leading to the decision to preclude plaintiff and two other passengers from travel on American on December 28, 2003, and because the specific nature of the security concerns in existence at the time of that decision are not reflected in documentation prepared personally by or at the direction of Mr. Marquis, plaintiff now seeks to

exclude from evidence testimony regarding the security concerns underlying the events that transpired on December 28, 2003. For the reasons set forth herein, American should be allowed to introduce testimony regarding the myriad of security issues raised in connection with Flight 2237 on December 28, 2003.

Case 1:05-cv-11652-WGY

At deposition, Mr. Marquis and Ms. Cobbs both testified that they have no independent memory of the facts and circumstances surrounding the decision to preclude plaintiff and two other passengers from traveling on Flight 2237. However, Mr. Marquis and Ms. Cobbs testified extensively about the manner in which such decisions are made, and confirmed that the documentation that was prepared contemporaneously with the events in question match that which he would expect from an incident of this kind. Deposition of Craig Marquis, pp. 21, 26-29, 39-40, hereinafter "Marquis Dep.," attached hereto as Exhibit 1. The SOC manager has information from multiple sources in his or her possession when making critical rebooking decisions; in this case, that information is reflected in reports made by the captain and flight attendants.¹ Marquis Dep., pp. 28-29. The SOC manager also has extensive communications with the captain. Marquis Dep., p. 28. Moreover, the SOC manager would be in contact with law enforcement personnel on the ground. Marquis Dep., p. 29.

Captain Ehlers' report and that of Flight Attendant Sargent make it clear that the flight crew and law enforcement agents were concerned that the plaintiff or one of the other removed passengers may have had a box cutter at the security check point, and that law enforcement was sufficiently concerned to remove the passengers, rescreen them, and bring in bomb-detecting dogs. Though Mr. Marquis may have no independent memory of these events at the present

¹ Although Mr. Marquis testified that he did not recall seeing the reports generated by Captain Ehlers and the flight attendants prior to preparing for his deposition, he testified that standard protocol requires extensive communication between the SOC manager and the captain of a flight on which a security incident is transpiring. Marquis Dep., pp. 23-24, 28.

time, his actions must be evaluated in light of the circumstances in existence when he made the decision to preclude plaintiff and two other passengers from rebooking with American on the day in question.

The cases cited in Plaintiff's motion lend little or no support to his contentions. As a preliminary matter, unlike the cases cited by Plaintiff, American does not assert that the decision to deny rebooking was for unspecified security concerns. Rather, contemporaneous documentation prepared by American's employees demonstrates the precise nature of those concerns; therefore, the citations to Loeb v. Textron, Inc., Marcano-Rivera v. Pueblo Int'l, Inc. and IMPACT v. Firestone have no bearing. Marcano-Rivera, 232 F.3d 245, 251 (1st Cir. 2000) (also irrelevant insofar it discusses evidence required to avoid Rule 50 dismissal); IMPACT, 893 F.2d 1189, 1194 (11th Cir.1990); *Loeb*, 600 F.2d 1003, 1012 (1st Cir.1979). Moreover, the cases cited by Plaintiff, save one, arise in the context of analyzing the prima facie case required to prove employment discrimination rather than in context of admissibility of evidence in a trial regarding provision of airline services. Finally, the Simmons v. American Airlines case also lends no credence to Plaintiff's contentions. In that case, the court reversed an award of summary judgment in favor of American Airlines because, when analyzing the case in the light most favorable to the plaintiff, it found insufficient evidence that lent support for the propositions advanced by American to justify its decision to deny service to a passenger. Simmons, 34 Fed. Appx. 573 at 4. The Simmons court made no finding as to whether the nature of the evidence would be sufficient to support a jury verdict in American's favor; the fact that the case was remanded for further proceedings suggests that the Simmons court believed American's proffered reasons for denying service were strong enough to merit a jury's consideration. *Id.*

Because there is no basis in law or fact to preclude a jury from hearing evidence regarding the security concerns that existed at the time Mr. Marquis made his decision to deny rebooking to the plaintiff and two other passengers, American requests that this Court DENY plaintiff's fourth motion in limine, with prejudice.

Respectfully submitted,
AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC.
By its Attorneys,

/s/ Amy Cashore Mariani_

Michael A. Fitzhugh, (BBO 169700) Amy Cashore Mariani, (BBO #630160) FITZHUGH, PARKER & ALVARO LLP 155 Federal Street, Suite 1700 Boston, MA 02110-1727 (617) 695-2330

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that this document filed through the ECF system will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) and paper copies will be sent to those indicated as non registered participants on November 30, 2006.

/s/ Amy Cashore Mariani
Amy Cashore Mariani

05-11652-WGY

John D. Cerqueira

VS.

American Airlines

Deposition of Craig Marquis

June 15, 2006



Tracey D. Smith, CSR, RMR Collins Realtime Reporting Dallas, Texas 75201 214-220-2449 www.collinsrealtime.net

June 15, 2006

Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

JOHN D. CERQUEIRA, Plaintiff) CIVIL ACTION NO. 05-11652-WGY AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC., Defendant

ORAL DEPOSITION OF CRAIG MARQUIS JUNE 15, 2006

ORAL DEPOSITION OF CRAIG MARQUIS, produced as a witness at the instance of the Plaintiff, and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered cause on the 15th of June, 2006, from 2:30 p.m. to 3:37 p.m., before Thu Bui, CSR in and for the State of Texas, reported by machine shorthand, at the offices of American Airlines, 4333 Amon Carter Boulevard, Fort Worth, Texas, pursuant to the Fed.R.Civ.P.30.

Thu Bui, CSR Collins Realtime Reporting 214-220-2449

June 15, 2006

	Page 2		Page 4
1 APPEARANCES		1	CRAIG MARQUIS,
2 Mr. Michael T. Kirkpatrick		2	having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:
PUBLIC CITIZENS LITIGATION GROUP 3 1600 200th Street, N.W.		3	EXAMINATION
Washington, D.C. 20009		4	BY MR. KIRKPATRICK:
4 Phone: 202-588-7728 Fax: 202-588-7795		5	Q Good afternoon, Mr. Marquis.
Email: mkirkpatrick@citizen.org 5		6	A Hello.
6 APPEARING FOR THE PLAINTIFF		7	Q We met earlier, but just for the record, my name
7		8	is Michael Kirkpatrick and I represent John Cerqueira,
8 Mr. Michael A. Fitzhugh FITZHUGH, PARKER & ALVARO LLP		9	who has brought this case against American Airlines.
9 155 Federal Street, Suite 1700		10 11	MR. KIRKPATRICK: Mr. Fitzhugh, same stipulations as the last one?
Boston, Massachusetts 02110-1727		12	MR. FITZHUGH: Yes.
10 Phone: 617-695-2330 Fax: 617-695-2335 Email: mfitzhugh@fitzhughlaw.com		13	You'll have an opportunity to read and sign
11		14	your deposition transcript, but there won't be a need for
12 APPEARING FOR THE DEFENDANT 13		15	a notarization, but I'll get it transmitted to you.
13		16	THE WITNESS: Okay.
15		17	Q Mr. Marquis, would you just state your name and
16		18	address for the record, please?
17 18		19	A Craig Marquis, M-a-r-q-u-i-s, address, 4403
19		20	Spring Creek Road, Arlington, Texas, 76017-1268.
20 21		21	Q Mr. Marquis, have you had your deposition taken
22		22	before?
23		23	A For this case?
24 25		24 25	Q No, in any case. A Yes, I have.
	D 2	23	
	Page 3		Page 5
1 INDEX		1	Q About how many times?
PAGE		2	A I believe I've been deposed two other times.
3 Appearances		3 4	Q What were those cases about? A One was for 9-11 and one was for a job that I
5 CRAIG MARQUIS		5	had prior to the airline business.
6 Examination by Mr. Kirkpatrick 4		6	Q I just want to quickly go over the ground rules
7 Examination by Mr. Fitzhugh 41		7	for today. I am here to ask you some questions, to
8 Signature and Changes 44		8	gather some information, and your job is simply to give
9 Reporter's Certificate 46		9	me your best and and most honest answer. You are
10		10	under oath as though we were in a court of law even
11		11	though we're in this informal atmosphere.
12		12	It's important because the court reporter
13		13	is taking down my questions and your answers that we not
14		14	speak at the same time, so I would just ask that you wait
15		15	until I finish my question before you start to give your
16 17		16 17	answers so that we get a clean transcript. Also if you don't understand one of my questions, please let me know
18		18	and I'll try to repeat it or rephrase it so that you do
19		19	understand it.
20		20	And if Mr. Fitzhugh objects to some of my
21		21	questions, those are objections for the record that we'll
22		22	deal with later if we need to. But unless he instructs
23		23	you not to answer, you should still try to answer my
24		24	question even though he's made an objection for the
25		25	record.

2 (Pages 2 to 5)

June 15, 2006

Page 6

1 And I don't think it'll take us too long

this afternoon, but if you need a break let me know and

- I'm happy to stop and take a break. But I would ask that
- we finish the -- the question that's pending and maybe
- 5 the line of questioning and find a convenient place to take a break if we need to do that.

Do you understand these instructions?

- A Yes, I do. 8
- 9 Q Do you know of any reason that would prevent you
- 10 today from giving me your best full and honest answers?
- 11

7

19

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- 12 Q Did you do anything to prepare for the
- deposition today? 13
- A Yes, I did. 14
- 15 Q What did you do?
- 16 A I read the information that Michael had sent me, just the due diligence, so that I could prepare and give 17
- an accurate and helpful testimony. 18
 - Q What were those documents, do you recall?
- 20 A They were letters back and forth from different
- 21 attorneys, the letter from the client, the letter back
- 22 from American Airlines in response.

else about today's deposition?

system operations control.

Q What is your current position?

Q How long have you had that job?

A Approximately six years.

- 23 Q Is it your understanding that those are
- 24 documents that the parties have exchanged in the course

Q Other than your discussions with -- with the lawyers for American Airlines, did you talk to anybody

Q How long have you been employed by American

A I'm the operational manager in SOC, which is

Q Could you describe for me your duties in that

A I represent higher management on this side of

Q And on a daily basis, what are the kinds of

the operation operating on schedule and safely?

out of service, manpower issues, air traffic control

issues, weather issues, safety issues, security issues,

tasks that you're required to carry out in order to keep

A I take into consideration equipment that may be

the highway to operate the published schedule efficiently

of this lawsuit?

Airlines?

position?

and safely.

environmental issues.

A 19 years.

A Yes.

Page 8

- 1 Q How many people do you have working for you on a particular shift?
- 3 A I'm the operational manager for the whole
- 4 airline, so the whole airline works for me.
- 5 Q Okay. What about within SOC, within your sort 6 of work place, how many people do you typically have 7 helping you carry out your duties?
- 8 A In SOC at one time?
 - Q Yeah.

9

- 10 A Probably 3' or 400. SOC encompasses a lot of 11 different departments.
- Q And you're in charge of all of SOC; is that 12 13 right?
- 14 A That's correct.
- 15 Q Can you explain to me the position of CCRO and how that position interacts with the SOC manager? 16
- 17 A The CCRO is a federally mandated position; it's
- corporate complaint resolution officer. Those people 18
- 19 were trained in the laws of disabilities, and they know
- 20 the rules and regulations, either the law or American
- Airlines guidelines and rules, and they sit two seats 21
- 22 down from my position, very close relationship, a lot of
- 23 interaction.
- 24 Q And have you been trained in the same things that the CCRO's have been trained in?

Page 7

1 A I have not.

8

2 Q Do you supervise the CCRO?

3

4 Q Prior to becoming operations manager, what other

5 positions did you have at American Airlines? If you

could just sort of work back in time, tell me the other б

7 jobs you've had.

A I started as an assistant dispatcher, then

9 became a dispatcher, then became an equipment coordinator 10

and became a sector manager and then a center manager. Q Is there only one CCRO on duty at a time? 11

- 12 A There is only one CCRO position.
- Q Were you working on December 28, 2003? 13
- 14 A Yes, I was.
- 15 Q What time did your shift start that day?
- A I believe 6:00 a.m., central. 16
- 17 Q And on that day, did you become aware that there
- 18 was an incident or concern with respect to Flight 2237,
- 19 which was a scheduled flight from Boston Logan Airport to
- 20 Ft. Lauderdale?
- 21 A I do not recall.
- 22 Q Is it your understanding, from the documents you
- 23 reviewed, that an incident occurred that day that
- 24 involved the removal of some passengers from that flight?
- 25 A Yes.

3 (Pages 6 to 9)

214-220-2449

Collins Realtime Reporting Thu Bui, CSR

Page 9

6

7

10

14

21

1

4

8

11

18

20

Craig Marquis

June 15, 2006

Page 12

Page 13

Page 10

Q Other than what you've learned by preparing for

- 2 this deposition, do you have any specific recollection of
- 3 what you did on December 28, 2003 with respect to that
- 4 flight out of Boston Logan?
- 5 A No.
- Q Do you have any specific recollection of anybody
- 7 you talked to that day, any conversations you had
- 8 regarding the incident with Flight 2237?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Do you know how long you were involved in
- 11 matters relating to that Flight 2237?
- 12 A I don't recall.
- Q Do you recall how you were first made aware, I'm
- 14 assuming that you were, that there was an incident with
- 15 that flight?
- 16 A Again, I don't recall.
- Q Do you have any recollection of any tasks that
- 18 you carried out on December 28, 2003 with regard to the
- removal of passengers or denial of re-booking related to that flight?
- 21 A I do not recall.
- Q Did you have any role in the decision to remove
- 23 three passengers from Flight 2237 for questioning by law
- 24 enforcement?

1

6

7

8

9

10

25 A No, I do not recall.

remove those passengers for questioning, am I right?

- 2 A That's correct.
- Q On December 28, 2003, did you do anything to determine whether any of the passengers on that flight posed a security threat?
 - posed a security threat?

 A I do not recall.

MR. FITZHUGH: If it'll help, we can

8 stipulate that's the day. You can just say on the day in9 question.

MR. KIRKPATRICK: Thank you.

- 11 Q And when I say "the incident", we all know what 12 I'm referring to.
- 13 A Okay.
 - MR. FITZHUGH: We'll so stipulate.
- Q Did you draw any conclusions on that day about
- whether John Cerqueira was a security risk?A I do not recall.
- Q Did you do any type of investigation about
- Mr. Cerqueira or the other two passengers removed fromthat flight?
 - A I do not recall.
- Q On that date, did you learn the results of any
- 23 law enforcement questioning of these passengers in
- 24 Boston?
- 25 A I do not recall.

Page 11

Q Do you recall whether anyone at SOC was

- involved, any person other than yourself, do you recall
 anybody else was -- was working on incidents related to
- 4 this Flight 2237?5 MR. FITZ

MR. FITZHUGH: Objection, form.

- You can still answer if you --
- Q If you understand my question.

MR. KIRKPATRICK: It wasn't a good

- question, but I think he understands what I'm saying.
- Q Was there anybody else that you can recall right now, this is the guy who handled that incident, do you
- now, this is the guy who handled that incident, do you recall anybody else who was directly involved in this
- 13 incident?
- 14 A I do not recall.
- Q Do you know who made the decision to have three passengers removed from Flight 2237?
- A Other than the information from the paperwork?
- 18 Q Okay. Yeah. Setting aside anything that you've
- 19 learned --
- 20 A No.
- 21 Q -- from the paperwork you looked at in
- 22 preparation for today's deposition?
- A No, I do not recall.
- Q Okay. And I take it that you then do not recall
- 25 what the specific reasons were for that decision to

- Q Did you communicate with the pilot to that
- 2 flight -- it was Captain John Ehlers -- did you
- 3 communicate with him on that day?
 - A I do not recall.
- 5 Q Who made the decision to deplane all the
- 6 passengers and re-screen them?
- 7 A I do not recall.
 - Q Who made the decision to have dogs brought onto
- 9 the plane?
- 10 A I do not recall.
 - Q Were you involved in making the decision that
- 12 the three passengers removed for questioning would not be
- 13 rebooked on the later American Airlines flight that day?
- 14 A I do not recall.
- 15 Q Do you know the basis for the decision not to
- 16 rebook those passengers on a later flight?
- 17 A I do not recall.
 - Q Do you recall anybody that you received
- 19 information from on that date about this incident?
 - A I do not recall.
- Q Do you recall anybody that you provided
- 22 information to on that date about this incident?
- 23 A No.
- Q Do you know when the decision was made to deny
- 25 further service to these three passengers?

4 (Pages 10 to 13)

1

4

10

11

12

13

14

19

21

2

3

Craiq Marquis

June 15, 2006

Page 14

1 A No.

5

2 Q Do you know how the decision not to rebook these

passengers was communicated to American Airlines'

4 personnel in Boston?

- A I do not recall.
- Q Do you know whether the three individuals

7 removed from the flight are barred from further travel on

8 American Airlines?

9 A Other than from the deposition or other from the 10 paperwork? It was stated in the paperwork that they as of January 6th, is that correct, 2004, they allowed that 11 person to travel; is that correct? 12

Q Okay. There are documents, yes, that --13

- 14 A I remember reading that in the document, --
- 15 Q In preparation --
- A -- that's all the information I know. 16
- 17 Q Okay. Other than any review of documents you
- did in preparation for this deposition, do you have any 18
- 19 knowledge about whether these individuals -- how long the
- 20 denial of service lasted?

MR. FITZHUGH: Objection, form. Why don't 21

22 you ask for each particular person?

23 MR. KIRKPATRICK: Okay.

24 Q With regard to Mr. Cerqueira, do you know how

long he was barred from travel on American Airlines?

Page 16

Page 17

Q In preparation for this deposition, did you see any documents that you had a hand in preparing?

- 3 A Other than the ones that were in the file, no.

 - Q Okay. Let's take a look at some documents,

5 because I'm not privy to what was in the file that you

looked at. But I'd like to just take a look at a series

7 of documents and, first, if you can tell me whether it's 8 one of the documents you reviewed in preparation for the

9 deposition, that would be helpful.

First, I'm going to show you what was previously marked as Exhibit 12, and this is a passenger name record for John Cerqueira. And it's five pages, so if you want to take a moment to familiarize yourself with

- 15 A I have seen this PNR.
- 16 Q When did you see it first?
- 17 A I saw this PNR a couple of weeks ago when I was
- 18 giving information on a case for Michael.
 - Q To prepare for the deposition?
- 20 A That's correct.
 - Q On December 28, 2003, did you add any
- 22 information to the detail notes for the event with this
- 23 ID number?
- 24 A No, I don't do that.
- 25 Q Did you instruct Rhonda Cobbs to add any

Page 15

- A Other from that documentation, I do not.
- 2 Q With regard to the other passengers removed from
- that flight, and the first one who is apparently in the
- aisle seat, Oren Ashmil, do you know how long he was
- barred from travel on American Airlines?
- 6 A No.

1

- 7 Q What about for Vittorio Daniel Rokah, who was in
- 8 the middle seat?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Before preparing for today's deposition, did
- 11 anybody from American Airlines contact you after
- 12 December 28, 2003 to discuss this incident?
- A Alec did. 13
- 14 Q That would be Alec Bramlett?
- 15 A That's correct.
- 16 Q Do you recall when that was?
- 17 A I do not. I was on shift; he called, asked me
- 18 if I recalled: I did not.
- 19 Q Do you have any -- do you have any --
- 20 A Can I look at this?
- 21 MR. FITZHUGH: No. That's for the
- 22 stenographer, just for some names.
- Q Did you prepare any documents or reports the day 23
- 24 of the incident regarding the incident?
- A I do not recall.

- information to this passenger name record?
 - A I do not recall.
- Q Did you instruct Nicole Traer to add any
- 4 information to this passenger name record?
- 5 A I do not recall.
- 6 Q Mr. Marquis, if you would please turn to the
- 7 second page, which is AA0024, and the -- the first entry
- 8 under the -- the time stamp, correct me if I'm wrong, but
- 9 I believe this means passenger denied travel on Flight
- 10 2237 per SOC Craig, due to security issue. CCRO will add
- event number shortly. Please refund tickets due to deny. 11
- 12 Boston customer service manager, N. Traer; is that
- 13 correct?
- 14 A I see that.
- 15 Q Does the notation, per SOC Craig due to security
- issue, do you believe that that's referring to you?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Does this refresh your recollection at all
- 19 about -- about whether you made a decision to deny
- boarding and refund the tickets to this passenger?
- 21 A It does not.
- 22 Q Looking down then, just a couple of lines below
- 23 that, there's an entry with the event ID number. And it
- states that above passenger denied boarding Flight 2237
- Boston-Ft. Lauderdale per SOCMOD, due security issues 25

5 (Pages 14 to 17)

June 15, 2006

Page 18

- refund ticket. Do not rebook on AA. And that,
- apparently, was input by Rhonda Cobbs. Are you the --
- were you the SOC, I guess, manager on duty that day?
- 4 A Yes, I was.

5

7

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

- Q Do you recall telling Rhonda Cobbs that this
- passenger should not be rebooked on American Airlines?
 - A I do not recall.
- 8 Q I think I can -- we're done with that exhibit.
- 9 Mr. Marquis, I'm showing you what's been previously
- 10 marked as Deposition Exhibit 18. If you wouldn't mind
- taking a look at these -- these pages that have been 11
- 12 collected together and labeled Exhibit 18. Let me know
- when you got a chance to take a look at it. 13
- 14 A Okay.
- 15 Q Do the documents we've labeled as Exhibit 18,
- 16 are these among the documents you reviewed in preparation
- 17 for the deposition?

your recollection?

A That's correct.

A That's fine.

Q Okay.

A It's just reporting.

A I do not recall.

- A I'm not sure these all were here, but I 18
- 19 remember -- I remember seeing the aircraft -- the
- 20 aircraft routing, some of the crew information. I don't
- recall that all of these were in that paperwork. 21
- 22 Q Do any of these exhibit pages in Exhibit 18, do
- 23 any of them refresh your recollection about the incident?

Q So, in other words, none of that has refreshed

Q Okay. Thank you, for -- for cutting to the

put you through a few more paces here.

preparation for today's deposition?

reason that this piece should stand out.

specifically what behavior that was?

chase there. I am though, just for the record, going to

Q If you wouldn't mind taking a quick look at

A I don't recall. I mean, there was a lot of --

Q All right. I'd like to ask you a couple of

it says, passengers reportedly exhibited suspicious

Q It -- it continues that there was some sort of

24 suspicious behavior on the aircraft observed by Number 2

flight attendant, Boston based S. Walling; do you know

behavior in airport towards captain, do you know

questions following up on -- on this Exhibit 14. Where

this is just general reporting for an event. There's no

Exhibit 14, and is this a document that you reviewed in

- 24 A They do not. Mr. Kirkpatrick, it doesn't seem
- to be anything spectacular or outstanding about all the

- Page 20
- specifically what she observed?
- 2 A I do not recall.
- 3 Q It also indicates that law enforcement officers
- 4 removed passengers, detained, questioned, and released
- 5 them. Do you recall anything about what law enforcement
- did with respect to these passengers? 7
 - A No, I do not.
- 8 Q It says, per SOCMOD passengers denied boarding
- 9 and tickets refunded; do you recall any specific reasons
- 10 why that decision was made?
- 11 A I do not.
- 12 Q It also says that security search of aircraft
- 13 was performed by dogs; do you recall specifically why
- that was done? 14
- 15 A I do not.
- 16 Q And it says that the flight attendants were
- replaced due to trauma; do you recall what it was that
- 18 caused that trauma?
 - A I do not.

19

24

6

9

- 20 Q Thank you. I'm handing you what's been marked
- 21 as Exhibit 13. Is this one of the documents you reviewed
- 22 in preparation for today's deposition?
- 23 A It may have been.
 - Q Thank you. I'm handing you what's been marked
- as Exhibit 11. What is Exhibit 11?

Page 19

- 1 A It looks like a request to -- from a flight paperwork that I've looked at that would stay in my mind.
 - 2 service manager or person asking the flight attendants to
 - 3 submit a report.
 - 4 Q Do you know whether reports were solicited at
 - 5 your instruction?
 - A I do not recall.
 - 7 Q What would be the purpose of asking the flight
 - 8 service people to file a report?
 - A Just for information gathering.
 - 10 Q Who do those reports go to, in other words, any
 - reports generated, you know, by flight attendants or 11
 - the -- the captain relating to this incident, would those 12
 - ordinarily be something that would go back to SOC manager 13

 - on duty or --14
 - A If I requested them specifically, they come to 15
 - me. If I didn't, then there's a reporting system called
 - the Event Call Center and they're submitted to the Event 17
 - 18 Call Center, and flight service then handles them.
 - 19 Q If they're submitted to that Event Call Center,
 - 20 in your position, would you ever have reason to go back
 - 21 and review them?
 - 22 A Hypothetically?

 - 23 Q Yeah.
 - 24 A If I had a question, I'd go and look at them.
 - 25 Q Do you know whether you did, with respect to

6 (Pages 18 to 21)

43550ef0-afba-45e7-b0a8-6a4ccc9607b6

214-220-2449

Page 21

June 15, 2006

Page 22 Page 24 this incident, whether you went to look at any reports 1 Q Anywhere else? 2 that were filed? A No. sir. 3 A I do not recall. There's nothing outstanding on 3 Q I'm handing you what's been marked as Deposition 4 Exhibit 16. This has been previously identified as the 4 this report, you know, it isn't a 9-11, it isn't Richard 5 Reid, it isn't, you know, a passenger being shot by FAMS. 5 statement of Captain Ehlers. Have you seen this before? 6 There's nothing here that stands out. 7 7 Q All right. Okay. Thank you. Q In preparation for today? 8 A You're welcome. 8 A That's correct. 9 9 Q Anywhere else? MR. FITZHUGH: FAMS means Federal Air 10 Marshals? 10 A No, sir. 11 THE WITNESS: That's correct. Q Are there any other documents or reports that 11 12 12 Q In preparation for today's deposition, did you were prepared contemporaneously to this incident by review call center reports filed by the flight 13 American Airlines' personnel that you reviewed, and that 13 attendants? 14 we haven't looked at today? 14 15 A The only thing I reviewed was the paperwork that 15 A No, not that I know of. I received from Michael. 16 Q Okay. Did you prepare any written report 16 related to this incident? 17 Q Okay. I'm going to show you a series of 17 18 exhibits, there's about five of them. And my question is 18 A I did not. 19 going to be the same for each, and it's whether you have 19 Q Do you know whether the CCRO that day prepared 20 seen it before. 20 any written report other than the detail notes that we've 21 A Seen them, okay. 21 looked at? 22 22 Q And if so, whether you saw it in preparation for A No. today's deposition or somewhere else. 23 23 Q You don't know or she did not? It wasn't a very 24 MR. FITZHUGH: Could we go off the record? 24 good question. 25 It may help. 25 A The information you have there with Rhonda's Page 23 Page 25 1 (Off the record from 3:01 to 3:01 p.m.) name on it is the correct way that we report, --2 Q Mr. Marquis, I'm handing you Exhibit 1, which 2 Q And --3 3 has previously been identified as a call center report of A -- that is the only report that she would do. 4 Flight Attendant Walling. Have you seen this before? 4 Q Okay. And as far as you know, that represents 5 the totality of what she recorded that day? A That's correct. 6 6 Q In preparation for today's deposition? 7 A That's correct. 7 Q Thank you. You mentioned earlier that 8 8 Mr. Bramlett contacted you to discuss this incident at Q Anywhere else? 9 A No, sir. 9 some time after December 20th, 2003. Other than that 10 Q I'm handing you what's been marked as Exhibit 5. contact and your contacts in preparation for today's 10 11 This has been previously identified as the call center 11 deposition, has anyone else from American Airlines report of Flight Attendant Sargent. Have you seen this 12 12 contacted you to discuss this incident? document before? 13 13 A No. 14 14 A Yes. Q Has anyone from outside American Airlines, such 15 Q In preparation for today's deposition? 15 as a government agency or a law enforcement agency, 16 A That's correct. contacted you to discuss this incident? 17 Q Anywhere else? 17 18 A No, sir. 18 Q When a passenger is removed from a flight or 19 19 Q I'm handing you what's been previously marked as denied boarding because of a perceived security concern, 20 Exhibit 9, which has been identified as a call center ordinarily, how long will the denial of service last 21 21 report of Flight Attendant Milencovic. Have you seen before that person can fly again? 22 22 this before? A To the extent you can -- can tell me that. 23 23 A Yes, I have. MR. FITZHUGH: I'm going to instruct the 24 Q In preparation for today? witness not to answer the question to the extent it would 25 A That's correct. call for the disclosure of sensitive security information

7 (Pages 22 to 25)

1

5

6

7

16

20

1

2

3

13

Page 26

within the purview of 49 CFR 1520.5. 1

If you can answer the question without disclosing such information, you may try to.

A It varies.

Q Where is it recorded to let, you know, for example, ticket counter personnel know that somebody should not be allowed to travel on American Airlines?

MR. FITZHUGH: Is it for security issues 8 9

or --10

2

3

4

5

7

MR. KIRKPATRICK: Yes, yes.

MR. FITZHUGH: Okay. I'm going to instruct 11 12 the witness not to answer the question for the same 13 reasons as stated in my earlier instruction.

Q If a passenger is removed or denied boarding, so 14 15 that further investigation can be done to determine if 16 there is security risk and nothing threatening or unusual

17 is found, are they ordinarily rebooked on a later

American Airlines flight? 18

A Hypothetically?

20 Q Yes.

19

5

6

7

8

15

16

21 A Removed by who?

22 Q For example, if the flight crew thought somebody 23 was behaving suspiciously, they have that person removed

and some type of law enforcement agent investigated that

24 person and found that there was an innocent explanation

Page 27

for whatever was perceived as -- as suspicious, and said

2 this person does not pose a risk for the security of the

3 flight, would that passenger ordinarily be rebooked on a

4 later flight?

A Each event is decided on its own merit and conditions and conduct. You're being very general.

Q I'm just wondering if there's a general rule.

A There is no general rule or guideline. You take the combination of all the information for that specific situation, you take your training, you take your 10 11

experience, and you make the decision.

12 Very generally, we're in the passenger 13 service business that carries passengers, we don't make 14 money if we leave everyone standing at the gate.

Q Is the decision whether a passenger should be rebooked made by the SOC manager on duty?

17

18 Q Is there anybody else who has the authority to

make the decision that somebody should not be rebooked? 19

20 A No.

21 Q When you make a decision that a passenger should 22 not be rebooked, do you record the reason anywhere?

23 A We have a recording -- do you see the recordings

in that -- the CCRO enters, that's the recording data 24

that we use.

Page 28

2 verbally tell the CCRO the decision as to whether to

rebook or not, the CCRO would then input that information

Q So, generally, the manager on duty in SOC would

4 into the computer system; is that right?

A That's correct.

Q When there is a security incident, such as the one that happened in this case, do you, as the SOC

8 manager on duty, communicate directly with the crew

9 members, for example, the pilot ordinarily? I know you

10 don't know remember the specifics of this incident, but,

11 ordinarily, would you get on the phone with the pilot? 12 A In general, there are procedures in place where

13 the pilot contacts SOC, yes.

14 Q And is it the manager on duty the point of

15 contact for the pilot?

A Yes.

17 Q Other than communicating with the pilot, are there other individuals that the manager on duty and SOC 18 19

would ordinarily be in communication with?

MR. FITZHUGH: Under what circumstances?

21 Q Under these circumstances, where a passenger has 22 been identified as potentially suspicious and there's

23 been a decision to remove the passenger, and the next

24 thing that happened is somebody contacts SOC manager on

25 duty. Under those circumstances, do you ordinarily have

Page 29

people that you communicate with?

A Well, there is no ordinary circumstance.

4 A Every circumstance is different. It would be

5 very easy to check boxes and make every circumstance

6 ordinary. No event is ordinary. I can tell you that I

7 communicate with people at the station that are passenger

8 service people, ground security people, law enforcement

9 people, crew members, yes.

10 Q Okay. Just so we're clear, with respect to this 11 incident, you don't recall the specifics of anybody you

12 may have communicated with?

A That is correct.

Q Has American Airlines provided you with training 14 15 on carrying out your duties in a nondiscriminatory

16 manner?

17 A Yes. We have a very clear and strong 18 anti-discrimination policy, and I think it's a law.

19 Q Has the -- the substance of that training

20 changed since December 28, 2003? 21

A No.

22 Q Does American Airlines have set procedures and

23 protocols for how to respond if a member of a flight crew

24 thinks a passenger is suspicious? And I'm not asking you

25 for the details, but does American Airlines have such a

8 (Pages 26 to 29)

June 15, 2006

Page 32

Page 33

Page 30

procedure or protocol in place?

2

5

- 3 Q Everything is handled on case-by-case basis?
- 4 A That's correct.
 - Q So the procedure is to contact SOC manager on
- duty, and then from there decisions are made about where
- 7 it goes from there; is that right?
- 8 A Not always. I mean, there's other people that
- 9 make security decisions; it depends on the severity. I
- 10 mean, as an example, they can find a bullet on board an
- aircraft on the ground. They're going to take the bullet 11
- off on their own, then they'll contact me. I haven't 12
- made that decision, but they have -- they're also 13 14 trained. They, you know, everyone follows the exact same
- 15 protocol, I mean, our training's the same, okay?
- Q And so the individuals involved in making those 16
- 17 decisions could be the captain, could be ground security
- coordinator, could be any number of people? 18
- 19 A As far as what decision?
- 20 Q A decision whether a passenger should be removed
- and further screened because of some sort of --21
- 22 A No. You were talking in general before. A
- 23 Captain or a GSE cannot remove a passenger. They cannot
- 24 do that --
- 25 Q Okay.

he's the in-flight coordinat -- you know, he's the

- in-flight guy, and then you have the ground guy.
- Everyone has the same training; everyone follows the same
- 4 rules, as far as contacting goes.
- 5 Q Okay. But it would be SOC -- if procedures were 6 followed correctly, it would be the decision of the SOC
- 7 manager on duty to remove a passenger for further 8 questioning?
- 9 A That's correct. And then that would be
- 10 irregular if those procedures are not followed.
- 11 Q Okay. And once that passenger was removed, 12
- let's say for further questioning by law enforcement
- 13 officers on the ground, it would be the SOC manager on
- duty who would decide whether those passengers, once 14
- 15 released by law enforcement, were either denied rebooking or were put on the next available flight? 16
- 17
- A In general, I wouldn't know the reason that the
- law enforcement officer would take a passenger off an 18
- 19 aircraft.
- 20 Q Okay. Let me clarify a little bit. If the
- 21 decision was made, passenger should be removed --
- 22 A By?
- 23 Q Let's say the SOC manager on duty --
- 24 A Okay.
- 25 Q -- decides, you know, crew members have reported

Page 31

- A -- not without first contacting SOC.
- 2 Q I see. And is the decision made by SOC manager
- 3 on duty?

1

- 4 A That's correct.
- 5 Q Have you ever been contacted after that decision
- has already been made and a passenger has been removed? 6
- 7 A Contacted by?
- 8 Q Like the first time SOC hears about it, is after
- the decision has already been made and the passenger's
- been removed from the aircraft? 10
- 11 A It may have happened once.
- Q Okay. But it would be an unusual circumstance? 12
- 13 A Very unusual.
- Q The ground security coordinator does not have 14
- 15 the authority to decide that a passenger should be
- removed for further questioning? 16
- A That's correct. 17
- 18 Q And the same with respect to the captain?
- 19 A That's correct.
- 20 Q Does the captain have the authority to say that
- they don't want a particular passenger to fly on their 21
- airplane without consulting SOC? 22
- 23 A No. The captain is the security coordinator
- onboard that aircraft. He is the security agent onboard 24
 - that aircraft. As I'm the operational security manager,

- some suspicious behavior, they've observed, something
- 2 that raises some questions, let's have that passenger 3 removed and let law enforcement investigate. Let's do
- 4 the background check, let's check the watch list, et
- 5 cetera, ask them some questions about, you know, what
- 6 they're doing and where they're going. Once law
- 7 enforcement is done, and let's say they become convinced
- 8 that the behavior was innocent and there's no threat to
- 9 safety, at that point, does the SOC manager on duty make
- the decision about whether that passenger should be put 10
- 11 on the next available flight, or denied rebooking and
- 12 given a refund?
- 13 A That's walking on the border of SSI, so I cannot 14 answer it.
- 15 Q But certainly, the SOC manager on duty is one
- 16 person that has the authority to make that decision,
- 17 correct?
- 18 A That's correct.
- 19 Q And the pilot does not have that authority?
- 20 A That's correct.
- 21 Q What about anybody in customer service, would
- 22 they have the authority to decide whether somebody should
- 23 be booked -- rebooked or not?
- 24
- 25 Q Mr. Marquis, I'm going to hand you what's been

9 (Pages 30 to 33)

June 15, 2006

Page 34 Page 36 whether a passenger can be denied service because of previously marked as Exhibit 10, and I'd ask you to generalized discomfort that the crew has with that review the third entry on that page, subject, removal of passengers. If you could just give that a quick read and passenger? 4 let me know when you're done. A I agree with that letter, yes. 5 5 A Which paragraph, I'm sorry? Q Is there anything that you would disagree with 6 6 Q The bottom one. The one where it starts, in the letter you just read? 7 7 A No, sir. subject, removal of passengers. 8 A How did you get this if it's confidential? 8 Q Mr. Marquis, I'm going to hand you what's been 9 9 marked as Exhibit 17, and I would ask, again, that you MR. FITZHUGH: Off the record. 10 (Off the record from 3:20 to 3:20 p.m.) review the document. And let me know once you've taken a Q Mr. Marquis, looking at that third entry there 11 11 look. 12 12 it -- it talks about reports of captains refusing to Mr. Marquis, do you agree that Exhibit 17 accept certain passengers on flights because of the 13 accurately reflects American Airlines' policy? 13 passengers' ethnic or religious backgrounds; are you 14 A I have never seen this before, but I agree with 14 15 aware of any such incidents? 15 most of this, and it does reflect the American Airlines' 16 16 A We've received calls, yes. thinking. 17 Q And when you say you've received calls, I 17 Q Is there anything you see in here that you 18 disagree with, or that you think is contradicted by your 18 mean --19 A From captains. 19 understanding of American Airlines' policy, anything you 20 Q From captains who were --20 would take issue with? 21 21 A Concerns. 22 22 Q Okay. And how were those handled? Q Thank you. How often are you involved in incidents in which a passenger is removed from a flight, 23 A The manager on duty discusses the concerns with 23 24 the captain. denied boarding, or refused service because of a security 25 Q And then if the manager on duty thinks that concern? Page 35 Page 37 there's not a problem, do they instruct the captain to 1 A I can't say. 2 accept the passenger and transport them? 2 Q I mean, is that something that happens every 3 A Yes. 3 day, every week, every month? 4 Q When it states that a pilot with questions 4 A You have 2300 flights a day. I may go in regarding particular passenger acceptance should contact, 5 tomorrow and have none; I may go in tomorrow and have it says the CCRO and it has a phone number there, is 6 ten. 7 7 Q Okay. that -- does that accurately state what a pilot should do 8 8 if it -- if the pilot has questions about a particular A There's no timetable for that. passenger's acceptance? 9 Q Okay. A I mean, you have times of the year where, you 10 A I believe that this is old, but it has 7299, 10 which is the CCRO position, which works on the podium know, there's holidays going on, red alerts, spring 11 11 12 with myself. break, you can understand. 12 Q Okay. 13 13 Q Certainly. How many SOC managers on duty are 14 there? I know there's only one at a time, but how many A So --14 15 Q So, generally, this --15 other people have the same responsibilities you do 16 A -- if you can call any of those 12 numbers, then 16 when --A There's four MOD's --17 17 that's just one. 18 Q Okay. Very good. I think I'm done with Exhibit 18 O Okay. 19 10. I'd like you to take a look at a document we've 19 A -- center manager MOD's. previously marked as Exhibit 19. And you can just take a 20 Q I see. Have you been involved in any incidents moment to review that, and let me know when you're done. 21 that resulted in a passenger complaining of 21 22 discrimination, other than this one? A Okay. 22 23 23 Q Thank you. Mr. Marquis, does the letter marked A Yes. as Exhibit 19, does it accurately reflect your 24 (Interruption.) 25 understanding of American Airlines' policy regarding A I'm sorry.

10 (Pages 34 to 37)

June 15, 2006

Page 38 Page 40 Q No problem. information that he obtained from law enforcement 1 2 A I had turned it off once. officers involved with the incident and other American 3 Q We can take a break if you need to. Airlines' personnel. Is that statement accurate, as far 4 A No, it's not necessary. 4 as you know? Q Okay. How many incidents -- how many such 5 5 A Yes. incidents that resulted in some sort of discrimination 6 Q But you don't recall today speaking to the law 7 7 enforcement officers or other American Airlines' complaint? 8 A One. 8 personnel? 9 9 A I do not recall, but those are things that we do Q Can you describe for me what happened in that 10 10 before we made that decision. Q Okay. Thank you. 11 11 A In general? A Yes, sir. 12 Q Let's start in general. 12 Q I can take that back. Other than the CCRO on 13 A A secret service agent was denied boarding. 13 Q Any other incidents that resulted in duty, I think we've established was Rhonda Cobbs, is 14 15 discrimination complaint? there anybody else within SOC that you would turn to to work on an incident, such as the one we're discussing? 16 A That's all. 16 17 Q In that incident with the secret service agent, 17 A Yes. 18 Q Who are those people? 18 were you the person that made the decision that that 19 passenger should be removed from the flight? 19 MR. FITZHUGH: I'm going to instruct the 20 MR. FITZHUGH: Objection, form, assumes 20 witness not to answer based upon it being SSI. facts not in evidence or established by the record. MR. KIRKPATRICK: And I'm not, just to be 21 21 22 22 Can you answer the question? clear, I'm not asking for their names in particular but 23 Q If you understand the question. In other words, 23 their positions. 24 were you the decision maker? 24 MR. FITZHUGH: It doesn't matter. It would 25 MR. FITZHUGH: I think you should lay a 25 violate 49 CFR 1520, particularly the sections of that Page 39 better foundation. I think it's -- the first question protocols, guidelines and implementation of security 2 you asked and he answered to, doesn't lead to the one you procedures. I'm instructing the witness not to answer 3 just asked. the question for those, among other elements of that 4 If you can answer the question, answer it. 4 title of the Code of Federal Regulations. 5 5 But otherwise -- I'll leave it up to you. Q Do you have any recollection about whether, with A Can you read the question prior, please? 6 regard to this incident, you interacted with anyone at 6 7 7 (Reporter read requested testimony.) SOC other than Rhonda Cobbs? 8 8 A I do not recall. Q Are you aware of any American Airlines' employee 9 Q Just give me a moment to look at my notes. who has been disciplined for considering a passenger's 10 MR. FITZHUGH: No problem. 10 race, color, national origin, or ethnicity in determining 11 MR. KIRKPATRICK: I think we're done. 11 whether the passenger should be removed from a flight, 12 12 I pass the witness. denied boarding or refused service? 13 13 (3:35 p.m.)14 14 A No. **EXAMINATION** 15 Q Mr. Marquis, I'm going to show you what's been 15 BY MR. FITZHUGH: previously marked as Deposition Exhibit 2. For the 16 Q Mr. Marquis, just a few questions about the record, this is an American Airlines' answers to incident you identified in response to Mr. Kirkpatrick's 17 17 plaintiff's first set of interrogatories, and I'd like 18 18 question about other customers complaining of 19 you to -- on Page 2, take a look at Interrogatory Number 19 discrimination. You recall your testimony on that point 20 2 with the question and the response. 20 about the secret service agent? 21 21 A Okay. A Yes, sir. Q Okay. The statement that Mr. Craig Marquis made 22 22 Q And was he removed from the flight, or was he this decision, we're talking about the decision to refuse 23 23 denied boarding on the flight or do you recall? service to Mr. Cerqueira after he was released from 24 A He was denied boarding. 24 25 questioning, Mr. Marquis made that decision based on Q So even though Mr. Kirkpatrick's question was

11 (Pages 38 to 41)

	Page 42		Page 44
1	about whether he was re about passengers removed from	1	CHANGES AND SIGNATURE
2	the flight, your answer, in fact, was about a situation	2	CRAIG MARQUIS JUNE 15, 2006
3	where a passenger was initially denied boarding?	3	PAGE LINE CHANGE REASON
4	A That's correct.	4	THE BIND CHARGE REASON
5	Q And with regard to the circumstances of his	5	
6	being denied boarding, do you recall the decision you	6	
7	made to deny him boarding?	7	
8	A Yes.	8	
9	Q And do you recall the reasons?	9	
10	A Yes.	10	
11	Q And without disclosing any SSI, describe why he	11	
12	was denied boarding on a flight.	12	
13	A Without disclosing SSI, it was due to his	13	
14	conduct.	14	
15	Q And was there an issue about him failing to	15	
16	provide some documentation that would have been required?		
17	A Yes.	17	
18	Q And was this ultimately explained to those who	18	
19	made inquiry of you as to the reasons for your decision?	19	
20	A Yes.	20	
21	Q And, to your knowledge, has that person ever	21	
22	pursued an administrative or legal complaint based upon	22	
23	your decision?	23	
24 25	A No, sir.	24	
	Q And at any time in your decision-making process,	25	
	Page 43		Page 45
1	were you aware of the agent's ethnicity?	1	I, CRAIG MARQUIS, have read the foregoing deposition
2	A No, sir.	2	and hereby affix my signature that same is true and
3	MR. FITZHUGH: That's all I have.	3	correct, except as noted above.
4	MR. KIRKPATRICK: I have nothing further.	4	
5	Thank you.	5	CD AIC MADOLIIS
6	(Off the record at 3:37 p.m.)	6	CRAIG MARQUIS
7	•	6 7	THE STATE OF)
8		8	COUNTY OF)
9		9	Before me, , on this day personally
10		10	appeared CRAIG MARQUIS known to me (or proved to me under
11		11	oath of through) (description of
12		12	identity card or other document) to be the person whose
13		13	name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and
14		14	acknowledged to me that they executed the same for the
15		15 16	purposes and consideration therein expresses. Given under my hand and seal of office this
16		17	day of , .
17		18	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
18		19	
19			NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR
20		20	THE STATE OF TEXAS
21		21	
22		22	
23		23	
24		24 25	
25		_∠5	

12 (Pages 42 to 45)

June 15, 2006

```
Page 46
             UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
1
              DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS
3
    JOHN D. CERQUEIRA,
4
      Plaintiff
5
    V.
                    ) CIVIL ACTION NO.
                     05-11652-WGY
    AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC., )
6
7
       Defendant
8
              REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
             DEPOSITION OF CRAIG MARQUIS
9
                 JUNE 15, 2006
10
      I, Thu Bui, Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for
11
    the State of Texas, hereby certify to the following:
       That the witness, CRAIG MARQUIS, was duly sworn by
12
13
    the officer and that the transcript of the oral
14
    deposition is a true record of the testimony given by the
15
    witness:
16
       That the deposition was submitted on June 22, 2006
17
    to the witness or to the attorney for the witness for
18
    examination, signature and return to my by July 12, 2006;
19
       That the amount of time used by each party at the
20
    deposition is as follows:
         Mr. Michael T. Kirkpatrick - 01:03
21
         Mr. Michael A. Fitzhugh - 00:02
22
23
       That pursuant to information given to the deposition
24
    officer at the time said testimony was taken, the
25
    following includes counsel for all parties of record:
                                                        Page 47
      Mr. Michael T. Kirkpatrick, Attorney for Plaintiff
1
      Mr. Michael A. Fitzhugh, attorney for Defendant
2
3
      I further certify that I am neither counsel for,
    related to, nor employed by any of the parties or
5
    attorneys in the action in which this proceeding
    Was taken, and further that I am not financially or
6
    otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.
8
      Certified to by me this 22nd day of June, 2006.
9
10
11
                  Thu Bui, CSR# 7618
12
                  Expiration Date: 12-31-07
                  Firm Registration No. 59
13
                  Collins Realtime Reporting
                  600 N. Pearl Street
14
                  Suite 640
                  Dallas, Texas 75201
15
                  Phone: 214-220-2449
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

13 (Pages 46 to 47)